Performance Support for Workplace Learning Leaders and Professionals

Will Thalheimer, PhD President Work-Learning Research, Inc. Somerville, Massachusetts, USA

Phone: 888-579-9814 Email: info@work-learning.com Website: work-learning.com Audits: LearningAudit.com Blog: willatworklearning.com Twitter: @WillWorkLearn

Bridging Gap between Research and Practice
Learning and Forgetting Curves

If our learners start here.

But end up here.

Have we maximized the learning benefits?

There are many possible after-training results, depending on:

(1) Design of the Learning
(2) After-Learning Follow-up

YouTube: http://is.gd/LearningForgettingCurves
Learning Intervention
Performance Situation
Learning Outcomes

On-the-Job Performance

Individual Results
Organizational Results

Later on the job, learners remember what they've learned. The learners get a return on their efforts. The organization gets a return on its investment.

On-the-Job Learning
Remembering

Prompting

The learners get a return on their efforts.

Learning Intervention
Remembering

Later on the job, learners remember what they've learned.

Learners apply what they've learned.

The learners get a return on their efforts.

The organization gets a return on its investment.

Organizational Results

Individual Results

Learners can learn on-the-job through trial & practice, insight learning, help from others, social media, studying on their own, etc.

Performance can be prompted through job aids, signage, intuitive cues, performance support, management, etc.

Our learners build understanding.

Learning

Remembering

Remembering

Learning

The learners get a return on their efforts.

Later on the job, learners remember what they've learned.

Learners apply what they've learned.

The learners get a return on their efforts.

The organization gets a return on its investment.

YouTube: http://is.gd/LearningLandscape


© Copyright 2009-2014 Work-Learning Research, Inc.
Learning Intervention

On-the-Job Learning

Remembering

Prompting

On-the-Job Performance

Individual Results

Organizational Results

Learning Outcomes

The Power of Triggering
Goal Setting vs. Trigger Setting

- Setting a Goal = “I intend to Lose Weight”
- Setting a Trigger =
  “I intend to Walk for 30 Minutes on Monday, Wednesday, and Friday as soon as I wake up.”
- IF Situation, THEN Action

Trigger-Setting Research
Setting Triggers to Write a Paper


Reviewed 94 separate experiments and found a medium-to-high magnitude ($d = .65$) for the benefits of implementation intentions. 92 of 94 experiments showed positive results!!

Attending a workshop, self-examination, buying organic, recycling, exercise, diet, solving law cases, taking vitamins.
GOAL: To consider threat-finance issues in my work as an intelligence analyst.

SITUATION: The next time I review message traffic, I will do the following:

ACTIONS:

A.
B.
C.
D.
Triggered Action Planning

- [http://is.gd/triggered](http://is.gd/triggered)

Training Course Reviews
Which Best Describes Your Organization’s Approach to Reviewing Your Training Courses?

- We REVIEW our training programs periodically, using A RESEARCH-BASED AUDITING APPROACH.
- We REVIEW our training programs periodically, using A SYSTEMATIC APPROACH.
- We REVIEW our training programs periodically, using A LARGELY UN-SYSTEMATIC APPROACH.
- We DON’T REVIEW our training programs, or DON’T REVIEW THEM VERY OFTEN.

The Decisive Dozen
for Learning Design and Learning Measurement

1. Content
2. Exposure
3. Guiding Attention
4. Creating Correct Conceptions
5. Repetition
6. Feedback
7. Variation
8. Retrieval Practice
9. Context Alignment
10. Spacing
11. Persuasion
12. Perseverance

http://is.gd/DecisiveDozen
http://is.gd/ddResearch
## In the Course Well Designed?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Why?</th>
<th>Code the Truth</th>
<th>Specify How Achieved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Focused attention is necessary for learning.</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credibility is critical to enable sustained attention and motivation within the learning process.</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Since understanding is a key goal for training, when learners show that understanding, we validate success and provide feedback to learners.</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remembering is a key goal, so courses should be designed with factors that support it.</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learners have to be more than skilled. They have to be willing &amp; eager to apply their learning.</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### How Does Your Course Measure Up?

Count up all the points your course earned. Feel free to give an item partial credit to better exemplify the result you feel it deserves. Remember, these numbers aren't prescriptive. They are intended to give you a general idea of how you're doing. Don't get hung up on the numeric outcome. We recommend that you set a target and work to achieve improvement.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Performance Domain</th>
<th>Total Score</th>
<th>Points Earned</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Performance Demoting</td>
<td>9.54</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Performance Stagnating</td>
<td>33.26</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Performance Nudging</td>
<td>33.26</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Performance Promoting</td>
<td>23.52</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Performance Boosting</td>
<td>33.40</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Performance Accelerating</td>
<td>49.50</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Total Score: 95.4 Points Earned: 50**

### The Decisive Dozen

The Decisive Dozen is a comprehensive list of the top 12 instructional design principles. The principles are based on extensive research and are designed to help instructors create effective learning experiences.

1. **Content Alignment:** When learners are engaged, they are more likely to retain and recall information.
2. **Exposure:** When learners are given opportunities to practice new skills in real-world situations, they are more likely to transfer their learning to new contexts.
3. **Guiding Attraction:** When learners are aware of the importance of the content, they are more likely to engage in the learning process.
4. **Creating Contextual Consistency:** When the learning materials are presented in a consistent and cohesive manner, learners are more likely to understand and retain the information.
5. **Repetition:** When learners are given repeated opportunities to practice, they are more likely to retain the information.
6. **Feedback:** When learners are given timely and specific feedback, they are more likely to improve their performance.
7. **Validation:** When learners are given opportunities to validate their understanding, they are more likely to feel confident in their learning.
8. **Content Alignment:** When learners are given opportunities to practice new skills in real-world situations, they are more likely to transfer their learning to new contexts.
9. **Retrieval Practice:** When learners are given opportunities to practice retrieving information, they are more likely to retain the information.
10. **Spacing:** When learners are given spaced opportunities to practice retrieving information, they are more likely to retain the information.
11. **Persuasion:** When learners are given opportunities to practice retrieving information, they are more likely to retain the information.
12. **Provenance:** When learners are given opportunities to practice retrieving information, they are more likely to retain the information.

(Copied from the Decisive Dozen, Practical Edheuristic. Reproduced with permission. For more information about the Decisive Dozen, visit PracticalEdheuristic.com.)
We Emphasize, Encourage, and Support Self-Directed Learning

We Encourage Self-Directed Learning

Many Supervisors Promote It on Their Own

We Do this Insufficiently

Which Best Describes Your Organization’s Approach to Supporting Self-Directed Learning?

Provide Job Aids to Guide Self-Directed Learning

- Engage Deeply in Learning
- Support Remembering
- Enable Creativity
- Avoid Biased Thinking
- Plan Formal Learning
- Find Varied Challenging Work
- Learn from Others
- Learn on Your Own Initiative
Coaching

The Coaching Debrief

*Part 1 – Coach Introduction*

Part of my job is to help you do your job better.

I try to do my best, but everybody can have blind spots, and really you know—better than I could ever know—what you need in terms of how to learn.

So, let me ask you a couple of questions so I can learn how I’m doing and how I can get better.
The Coaching Debrief
Part 2 – Coach Asks What Can I do Better?

What can I do better in coaching you?
Here’s a list of some common coaching issues. Select them all or as many as you like. Add more if you want.

1. Spend more time with me.
2. Let me know it’s okay to ask questions.
3. Give me a better sense of the big picture.
4. Help me understand that I’ll get this eventually.
5. Go more slowly when showing me what to do.
6. Watch me work and give feedback.
7. Schedule regular meetings with me.
8. Help me be more organized.
9. Give me some praise or acknowledge my effort from time to time.
10. Encourage me to set my own learning goals.
11. Follow-up later to see how I’m doing.

The Coaching Debrief
Part 3 – Coach Asks Follow-Up Questions

What else could I do that would help you get up to speed and feel more comfortable?

What else could the company do?
Coaching Debrief Template (page 1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ask for help</th>
<th>Part of my job is to help you learn the system and learn how to have successful calls. I try to do my best, but everybody can have blind spots, and really you know—better than I could ever know—what you need in terms of how to learn. So, let me ask you a couple of questions so I can learn how I’m doing and how I can get better.</th>
<th>In your own words:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What can I do better?</td>
<td>What can I do better in coaching you? Here’s a list of some common coaching issues. Select them all or as many as you like. Add more if you want. (see page 2)</td>
<td>In your own words:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What else could I do?</td>
<td>What else could I do that would help you get up to speed and feel more comfortable using the system or handling calls? What else could ADP do?</td>
<td>In your own words:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Coaching For Learning

----------

Taxonomy

----------

Five Levels

1. Coach Fixes the Issue
   - Coach
   - Learner
2. Learner Observes
   - Coach
   - Learner
3. Learner Follows
   - Coach
   - Learner
4. Learner Practices, Gets Feedback
   - Learner
   - Coach
5. Learner Consults when Needed
   - Learner
   - Coach

Level 1
- Fix

Level 2
- Observes

Level 3
- Follows

Level 4
- Practices

Level 5
- Consults

Stakeholder Management

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholder Map</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Decider?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Does Person Have Absolute Power to Say YES or NO?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Resource?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Does the Person Have Power to Provide Resources?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Persuader?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Does Person Have Power to Persuade Significant Others?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Friend/Enemy?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Does Person Have Ability to Provide or Undermine Emotional Support?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Worker?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Is Person Able to Work to Help Implement the Change?</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Champion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Supporter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resistor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blocker</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Instructions:**
1. Consider all the people who may influence the success of your change initiative.
2. Put their names in the appropriate cell above (people can be in more than one column). Add yourself.
3. Continue with stakeholder management, including seeking input, working together, looking for wins-wins.
Learning Staff vs. Workplace Responsibilities for Learning Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning-Performance Flow Diagram</th>
<th>Responsibilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Before Training</strong></td>
<td><strong>Learning Professionals</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparation</td>
<td>Understand Business Needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Situation</td>
<td>Determine Learning Needs (if any)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Event</td>
<td>Create Learning Performance Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding</td>
<td>Create Evaluation Plan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>On-the-Job Performance Situation</th>
<th>Responsibilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>On-the-job Remembering</td>
<td>Engage Learners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-the-job Prompting</td>
<td>Create Understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-the-job Learning</td>
<td>Enable Remembering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-the-job Application</td>
<td>Provide Practice Opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluate Remembering</td>
<td>Enable Future Workplace Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluate On-the-job Application</td>
<td>Inspire Learners to Apply Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluate Management Support</td>
<td>Evaluate Understanding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help Managers Improve Application</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Results</th>
<th>Objectively Evaluate Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organizational Results</td>
<td>Honestly Discuss Outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Results</td>
<td>Convey Results to Stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Plan Improvements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© Copyright 2009 – 2010 by Will Thalheimer.

www.work-learning.com
Designing Scenario-Based Questions

Writing Scenario-Based Questions

• From Workshop
Subscription Learning

Scheduling of Learning Events

One-Time Event

Multiple Events

Subscription

www.SubscriptionLearning.com
Serious eLearning Manifesto

elearningmanifesto.org

Michael Allen  Julie Dirksen  Clark Quinn  Will Thalheimer
Principles of the Serious eLearning Manifesto

1. Do Not Assume that Learning is the Solution
   - eLearning platforms do not automatically improve learning outcomes. Before implementing eLearning, ensure that it aligns with the overall learning objectives.

2. Do Not Assume that Learning is the Answer
   - eLearning is not a silver bullet for all learning needs. It should be used in conjunction with other learning methods and strategies.

3. Do Not Assume that Learning is Independent
   - Learning is a social activity. eLearning should facilitate collaboration and interaction among learners.

4. Do Not Assume that Learning is Passive
   - Active learning engages learners more effectively. eLearning should include interactive elements like quizzes, simulations, and discussions.

5. Do Not Assume that Learning is Motivated
   - Motivation is crucial for effective learning. eLearning should incorporate gamification and personalized learning experiences to keep learners engaged.

6. Do Not Assume that Learning is Measured
   - Measuring learning outcomes is essential. eLearning should include formative and summative assessments to evaluate learning effectiveness.

7. Do Not Assume that Learning is Complete
   - Learning is a continuous process. eLearning should provide opportunities for learners to revisit and reinforce their knowledge.

8. Do Not Assume that Learning is Repeatable
   - Each learner's learning journey is unique. eLearning should be adaptable to accommodate different learning styles and needs.

22 Principles available at: [is.gd/manifesto22](http://is.gd/manifesto22)
"How to Use the Manifesto"

- Not Yet Published

**Employment Launches**

Use the Manifesto to Build Your Legal Argument

- To build your case, utilize the principles of the Silent Learning Manifesto as a well-researched solution for maximizing efficiency.
- To communicate with others, use the Manifesto as a fair representation of what effective learning behaviors are.

Use the Manifesto to Grow Your Clients

- Ask your clients about their legal accountability in their learning design based on the Manifesto's 10 principles.
**Very Weak Relationship between Levels**


**Weak Relationship is below .30 and .09 is VERY WEAK**

So...SMILE SHEETS tell us VERY LITTLE about Learning

Percent of Companies Using
““To Any Extent””

1. Technology – Reaction 52%
   Classroom – Reaction 81%

2. Technology – Learning 43%
   Classroom – Learning 50%

3. Behavior 15%
   Behavior 25%

4. Results 10%
   Results 14%

5. ROI 6%

ASTD and i4cp

Likert-like Scales provide Poor Data

A. Strongly Agree 5
B. Agree 4
C. Neither Agree Nor Disagree 3
D. Disagree 2
E. Strongly Disagree 1

Compared to:
- Previous
- Standard
- Others
Transmogrify

We Start with Fuzzy Adjectives

Magically We Turn Adjectives Into Numbers

We Average Responses, Losing More Info

We Choose One Question and Report Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neither Agree Nor Disagree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Specific Concepts

Value of Specific Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learning Concept</th>
<th>Circle One # Below</th>
<th>Circle ONE Below</th>
<th>Circle ONE Below</th>
<th>How well was concept taught?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How valuable is the concept to you?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value of this Concept (Circle NUMBER) Low 1 2 3 4 5 6 High</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How new was concept to you?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Concept was new to me.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Deepened earlier understanding.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Provided nice reminder.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. I already use concept regularly.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Most people already know this.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How well was concept taught?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Taught really well.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Taught well.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Taught inadequately.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Taught poorly.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Two common practices in measurement bias our results. Measuring learning at end of program may bias the results. Similarly, measuring learning in the learning context.

B. Measuring retrieval is essential (even if we measure on-the-job performance and results) because retrieval is required for on-the-job application. It is the causal pathway from learning to performance and results.
### Slowing down the respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Overall Ratings</th>
<th>Very Little Value</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>Average Value</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>Highest Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rate the overall value of the learning experience.</th>
<th>Circle ONE number (Please Don’t Circle the Words).</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rate your physical comfort during the learning experience. (Consider breaks, food, temperature, furniture, lighting, etc.). Circle ONE number.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood that you will utilize what you learned in the next two weeks. Circle ONE of the percentages.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood that you will share what you’ve learned with a coworker or friend in the next two weeks.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### How prepared are you to act on this knowledge?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I Am Not Yet Ready</th>
<th>I Have Awareness</th>
<th>I Know What to Do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### Comment on relevance to topic to your current or future work:

**Now, how prepared are you to act on this knowledge?**

**How could we improve our training on this?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I Am Not Yet Ready</th>
<th>I Have Awareness</th>
<th>I Know What to Do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### I Am Not Yet Ready

**Comment on relevance to topic to your current or future work:**

**How could we improve our training on this?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I Am Not Yet Ready</th>
<th>I Have Awareness</th>
<th>I Know What to Do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### I Have Awareness

**Comment on relevance to topic to your current or future work:**

**How could we improve our training on this?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I Am Not Yet Ready</th>
<th>I Have Awareness</th>
<th>I Know What to Do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

#### I Know What to Do

**Comment on relevance to topic to your current or future work:**

**How could we improve our training on this?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I Am Not Yet Ready</th>
<th>I Have Awareness</th>
<th>I Know What to Do</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Performance Training +
Performance Assistance

Adds performance assistance elements like coaching, job aids, performance support, reminders, and supervision—to ensure that learning is applied successfully on the job.

Performance Training

In addition to presenting information, also provides realistic practice, spaced repetitions, and engenders motivation to apply learning.

Awareness Training

Provides information to learners and helps them understand the concepts that are conveyed.

Where Do the Various Learning Meta-Methods Get Us?

- Performance Training + Performance Assistance: No panacea, but supports understanding, remembering, AND on-the-job application of learning!
- Performance Training: Supports understanding and remembering, but NOT on-the-job application of learning!
- Awareness Training: Supports understanding, but NOT remembering!
## Performance-Focused Smile Sheet

### Ultimate Goal

**Maximally Effective Smile Sheet**

### Primary Goals

**Training Effective?**
- Will the training be effective in supporting on-the-job performance?

### Secondary Goals

- **Learners Understand?**
- **Learners Remember?**
- **Learners Motivated to Apply?**
- **After-Training Supports in Place?**

### Tertiary Goals

- **Learners Engaged**
- **Cognitive Supports Effective**
- **Realistic Retrieval**
- **Sit-Action Triggers**
- **Belief in Value of Concepts**
- **Self-Efficacy in Skill Area**
- **Inoculated**
- **Job Aids**
- **Supervisors Follow-Up**

### Secondary Questions

- **Do Smile Sheet Decisions Accurate? Avoiding GIGO?**
- **Do Smile Sheet Results Distinguish between Different Levels of Success?**
- **Are We Measuring the Things that Matter?**
- **Are We Using the Smile Sheet Opportunity to Educate Our Stakeholders?**

### Tertiary Questions

- **Learners Remember?**
- **Are we measuring the things that matter?**
- **Do we use the smile sheet opportunity to educate our stakeholders?**

## Additional Notes

- From the information, can we determine whether a course needs to be maintained, improved, or removed? Are we avoiding numeric averages that discourage a standards-based decision on success and failure?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ultimate Goal</th>
<th>Primary Goals</th>
<th>Secondary Goals</th>
<th>Tertiary Goals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Maximally Effective Smile Sheet</strong></td>
<td><strong>Training Effective?</strong></td>
<td><strong>Learners Understand?</strong></td>
<td><strong>Learners Engaged</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Learners Remember?</strong></td>
<td><strong>Cognitive Supports Effective</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Learners Motivated to Apply?</strong></td>
<td><strong>Realistic Retrieval</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>After-Training Supports in Place?</strong></td>
<td><strong>Sit-Action Triggers</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Belief in Value of Concepts</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Self-Efficacy in Skill Area</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Inoculated</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Job Aids</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Supervisors Follow-Up</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While smile sheets are not capable on their own to determine effectiveness, we should at least try to examine the four goals, (1) understanding, (2) remembering, (3) motivation to apply, (4) after-training support. We should use smile sheets to send stealth messages to our stakeholders, including senior decision makers, instructors, and instructional designers.
ULTIMATE GOAL
MAXIMALLY EFFECTIVE SMILE SHEET

WHAT MOST SMILE SHEETS PROVIDE
RESULTS ACTIONABLE?
Will the Smile-Sheet results communicate with clarity and urgency to guide action?

TRAINING EFFECTIVE?
Will the training be effective in supporting on-the-job performance?

PRIMARY GOALS

SECONDARY GOALS

TERTIARY GOALS

LEARNERS ENGAGED?

Cognitive Supports Effective

REALISTIC RETRIEVAL

SPACING

SIT-ACTION TRIGGERS

BELIEF IN VALUE OF CONCEPTS

SELF-EFFICACY IN SKILL AREA

INOCULATED

JOB AIDS

SUPERVISORS FOLLOW-UP

QUATERNARY GOALS

Traditional Smile Sheets

Learners rate instructors as credible and engaging?

Learners rate instructors as supportive of their learning?

Learners say that classroom environment was conducive to learning?

Learners satisfied with experience?

Learners think course was well-organized?

TRAINING RESPONSE FORM
Your insights help improve training for everyone!

LEARNERS UNDERSTAND?

LEARNERS REMEMBER?

LEARNERS MOTIVATED TO APPLY?

After-Training Supports in Place?

LEARNERS SMILE SHEET DECISIONS ACCURATE?

DO SMILE SHEET RESULTS DISTINGUISH BETWEEN DIFFERENT LEVELS OF SUCCESS?

ARE WE MEASURING THE THINGS THAT MATTER?

ARE WE USING THE SMILE SHEET OPPORTUNITY TO EDUCATE OUR STAKEHOLDERS?

WHAT MOST SMILE SHEETS PROVIDE
QUADRUPLICITY GOALS

Traditional Smile Sheets

Learners rate instructors as credible?

Learners rate instructors as engaging?

Learners rate instructors as supportive of their learning?

Learners say that classroom environment was conducive to learning?

Learners satisfied with experience?

Learners think course was well-organized?
### Performance-Focused Smile Sheets

**Published by End of Year**

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Circle One Answer Per Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. How are you feeling today?</td>
<td>B. Yes, I understand the instructions for the exercise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. How many times do you go to the gym?</td>
<td>D. Yes, I understand the instructions for the exercise.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. How many times do you go to the gym?</td>
<td>F. Yes, I understand the instructions for the exercise.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What is your job role?</th>
<th>Circle One Day</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Instructional designer, developer, etc.</td>
<td>Done One Day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Name, position, team, project, etc.</td>
<td>Done One Day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Learning measurement professional</td>
<td>Done One Day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Senior manager of learning training</td>
<td>Done One Day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Other ______________________________</td>
<td>Done One Day</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

What should you be doing? If you are not,圈出下面的选项。

- A. My main responsibilities are...
- B. My main responsibilities are...
- C. My main responsibilities are...
- D. My main responsibilities are...
- E. Other ______________________________

---

**What should you be doing?**

- A. My main responsibilities are...
- B. My main responsibilities are...
- C. My main responsibilities are...
- D. My main responsibilities are...
- E. Other ______________________________

---

**What should you be doing?**

- A. Your main responsibilities are...
- B. Your main responsibilities are...
- C. Your main responsibilities are...
- D. Your main responsibilities are...
- E. Other ______________________________

---

**What should you be doing?**

- A. Your main responsibilities are...
- B. Your main responsibilities are...
- C. Your main responsibilities are...
- D. Your main responsibilities are...
- E. Other ______________________________

---

**What should you be doing?**

- A. Your main responsibilities are...
- B. Your main responsibilities are...
- C. Your main responsibilities are...
- D. Your main responsibilities are...
- E. Other ______________________________
1. Training is not enough.
2. Training for awareness is a weak and insufficient approach.
3. Training should specifically minimize forgetting and support remembering.
4. It is better to train a few things really well, than many things perfunctorily.
5. Training should motivate subsequent on-the-job application.
6. Training content must be correct, validated, and relevant.
7. Smile sheets are inadequate.
8. We must measure to provide ourselves with feedback to spur continuous improvement.
9. Prompting mechanisms (like job aids and performance support) should be used—as appropriate—as an integral part of training and as a replacement for training.
10. On-the-job learning should be leveraged in addition to formal training.
11. Learners’ managers and others within the learners’ chain of command should support after-training application.
12. Supervisors play a critical role in enabling the success of training and in helping people be creative on the job.
The Five Failures of Workplace Learning

1. Minimizing Forgetting, Improving Remembering
2. Training Follow-Through
3. Prompting Mechanisms
4. On-the-Job Learning
5. Measurement and Feedback to Spur Improvement

www.tinyurl.com/fivefailures
There are Leverage Points within our SOP's from where we can send Stealth Messages for Recruiting of Work-Learning Professionals.

Formal Course Evaluations, Annual Reports to Management, On-the-Job Performance Data, and Instructor Evaluations all contribute to workplace performance data and workplace performance assistance.

The Annual Course Reviews (our response) include:

- Course Review Template
- CPT & CPLP
- Smiley sheets
- Performance-Focused smile sheets & delayed smile sheets

Chapter on Change Management & Stealth Messages

www.work-learning.com/catalog.html
Miscellaneous

- Knowledge elicitation for needs analysis
- Faculty-evaluation template
- Supervisor-driven turnover-prevention job aid

- Onboarding discussion template for managers and new hires
- Supervisor onboarding checklist
- Structured interview list of questions

www.work-learning.com/catalog.html

What other types of prompting mechanisms have you seen to support learning professionals?

What else would you like to see?
Thank you!!
Slides available at: www.is.gd/willstuff

Will Thalheimer, PhD
President
Work-Learning Research, Inc.
Somerville, Massachusetts, USA

Phone: 888-579-9814
Email: info@work-learning.com
Website: work-learning.com
Audits: LearningAudit.com
Blog: willatworklearning.com
Twitter: @WillWorkLearn